Citation: Alkhalidy v. Canada (Canada Border Services Agency), 2018 CART 8

Date: 20180830

Docket: CART/CRAC-1986

**BETWEEN:** 

Ali Alkhalidy,

**APPLICANT** 

- and -

Canada Border Services Agency,

**RESPONDENT** 

**BEFORE:** Luc Bélanger

Chairperson

WITH: Mr. Ali Alkhalidy, the Applicant, representing himself; and

Ms. Sonya Bisson, representing the Respondent

In the matter of an application made by the Applicant to the Canada Agricultural Review Tribunal, pursuant to paragraph 9(2)(c) of the <u>Agriculture and Agri-Food Administrative Monetary Penalties Act</u>, for a review of the facts of a violation of section 39 of the <u>Plant Protection Regulations</u>.

## **DECISION**

The Canada Agricultural Review Tribunal, by ORDER, confirms the settlement agreement reached by the parties.

By written submissions only.

5	<b>ETTL</b>	EMENT	. 2
	I.	BACKGROUND	. 2
		OFFER TO SETTLE	
	III.	THE SETTLEMENT	. 3
		ORDER	3

## **SETTLEMENT**

## I. BACKGROUND

- [1] On May 25, 2018, it is alleged that the Applicant, Mr. Ali Alkhalidy, imported to Canada a thing that is or could be infested or constitutes or could constitute a biological obstacle to the control of a pest, namely plums, and did not declare this product to an inspector, thereby contravening section 39 of the *Plant Protection Regulations*. Consequently, the Canada Border Services Agency (Agency) issued him Notice of Violation 4312-18-0079 with penalty of \$800 for a "serious" violation of the law.
- [2] Mr. Alkhalidy applied to the Canada Agricultural Review Tribunal (Tribunal) for a review of the facts of the alleged violation pursuant to paragraph 9(2)(c) of the <u>Agriculture</u> and <u>Agri-Food Administrative Monetary Penalties Act</u>.

## II. OFFER TO SETTLE

- [3] On August 8, 2018, the Agency presented an offer to settle the case to Mr. Alkhalidy.
- [4] Following this proposal, the Notice of Violation 4312-18-0079 would become a Notice of Violation with warning, and the violation by Mr. Alkhalidy would remain in the Agency's records for a period of five years in accordance with section 23 of the <u>Agriculture</u> and <u>Agri-Food Administrative Monetary Penalties Act</u>.
- [5] Mr. Alkhalidy accepted this proposal by way of a letter attached to an email received by the Tribunal on August 21, 2018.
- [6] The Agency proceeded to withdraw Notice of Violation 4312-18-0079 with penalty of \$800, replacing it with Notice of Violation 4312-18-0100, issued with warning.

Page | 3

III. THE SETTLEMENT

[7] This agreement constitutes a settlement between the parties. This is not an order of

the Tribunal which can be the subject of a judicial review application pursuant to

subsection 12(2) of the *Canada Agricultural Products Act* (CAP Act).

[8] This settlement agreement constitutes a final settlement of the rights of both parties

in relation to docket CART | CRAC-1986 and the events which occurred on May 25, 2018.

[9] As was described in the Agency's settlement offer letter, a violation in the name of

Mr. Alkhalidy will remain in the Agency's records for the next five years.

[10] This settlement should not be cited as a precedent or otherwise relied on except in

relation to the current settlement.

IV. ORDER

[11] As requested by the parties and pursuant to the powers attributed to it by section 8

of the *CAP Act*, the Tribunal, by ORDER, confirms the settlement agreement.

Dated at Ottawa, Ontario, on this 30th day of August 2018.

Luc Bélanger

Chairperson

Canada Agricultural Review Tribunal